

MINUTES
The Spartanburg Board of Architectural Design and Historic Review
Thursday, June 11, 2015 ~ 5:30 PM
City Hall Council Chambers

Board Members Attendance: Thomas Belenchia, Lewis Settle, Thomas Koenig, Sarah Love, and Carolyn Schoepf-Harrison.

Absent Board Members: Dr. Phillip Stone and Michael Chewning.

City Staff: Joshua Henderson, Planning Coordinator; Julie Roland, Administrative Assistant, and Martin Meek, Preservation Specialist.

Mr. Belenchia, Acting Chair, called the meeting to order at 5:30 P.M. and stated the hearing procedures. Mr. Belenchia recognized the four board members that were currently present constituted a quorum, and he proceeded with the guidelines for the procedure of the meeting.

Mrs. Love moved to approve the Agenda for tonight's meeting; and she was seconded by Mr. Settle. The motion was approved by a vote of 4 to 0.

Disposition of the minutes from the February 12, 2015 Meeting of the Board of Architectural Design and Historic Review.

Mr. Settle moved to approve the minutes from the February 12, 2015 Meeting, and was seconded by Mrs. Love. The motion was unanimously approved by a vote of 4 to 0.

Old Business

There was no old business for discussion.

New Business

Certificate of Appropriateness for Major Work – Consider the construction of a new infill house on a vacant lot, newly addressed as 100 Timothy Street, at the corner of Timothy Street and West Hampton Avenue in Hampton Heights. Olivia White, purchase of property, own behalf of current property owner, Melvin Varner.

Mr. Henderson came forward and was sworn, and submitted the report the Board Members had previously received, as well as the slides and presentation into evidence as Exhibit A and B. He informed the Board Members the property was located at the corner of Timothy Street and West Hampton Avenue; and the property was previously addressed on West Hampton Avenue. Ms. White would like to build an approximately 891 square foot, one –story home on the property. Mr. Henderson showed the following slides: location map, aerial map, and the proposed house. He said the proposed house would fall under the classification of a “shotgun cottage” or “gable front family/natural front house” style of architecture, minus the porch shown on the picture. He explained the applicant wanted to go with a porch that was more appropriate to this style of architecture. Mr. Henderson explained to the Board Members the proposed house would be constructed within the approved buildable area set forth in the City of Spartanburg Zoning Ordinance which are a thirty (30’) foot rear and front yard setback from the property line, and an eight (8’) interior side yard setback, and a fifteen (15’) street side yard setback. The proposed structure would consist of Hardiplank Cedarmill lapped siding, six over six double hung wood windows with aluminum clad on the exterior throughout the house, a Craftsman Style wood entry door, GAF Lifetime-Warranty Timberline Natural Shadow Pewter Gray Shingles, and Timberlane Premium Wood Panel Shutters Style FP2. Slides of the neighborhood, site plan, and architectural renderings were shown in order to better illustrate the request. Mr. Henderson said he had consulted with the City’s Preservation Architect, Martin Meek regarding the proposed new construction; and he said Mr. Meek had confirmed this style of architecture was appropriate for the neighborhood.

Mr. Henderson went over the following Guidelines taken from The Spartanburg Design Manual, regarding new construction:

6.1 Define Area of Influence

- Guideline – *Define the area of influence in considering the appropriateness of a design for a new building in a historic district. It is important to determine the area of influence by the building; a consistent streetscape will result when new buildings are designed in consideration with what already exists. The proposed style of architecture is consistent with the era of the neighborhood and can be documented in other areas of Spartanburg. It will not be a detriment to the overall historic character of the neighborhood.*

6.2 Recognizing the Prevailing Character of Existing Development

- Guideline – *Identify and respect the prevailing character of adjacent historic buildings and surrounding development.* The proposed structure fits with the prevailing homes in the area.

6.2.1 Building Orientation and Setback

- Guideline – *The orientation of a new building and its site placement shall appear to be consistent with the dominant patterns within the area of influence, if such patterns exist.* The proposed structure meets all required setbacks set forth in the City of Spartanburg Zoning Ordinance, as well as, the surrounding residential structures.

6.2.2 Directional Emphasis

- Guideline – *A new building's directional emphasis shall be consistent with dominant patterns of directional emphasis within the area of influence, if such patterns exist.* The proposed structure, as well as all other primary residential structures, will face Timothy Street.

6.2.3 Shape

- Guideline - *Roof pitch shall be consistent with those of existing buildings.* The roof pitch will consist of a front gable which is consistent with homes within the historic district.
- Guideline – *Porch form shall be consistent in shape and size with those of existing buildings.* The porch that is represented in the renderings will not be constructed. The applicant is proposing to have a front porch matching the design of what is shown in the attached photograph and depicted in the book, *A Field Guide to American Houses* by Virginia and Lee McAlester.
- Guideline – *The principal elements and shapes used on the front façade of a new building shall be compatible with those of existing buildings in the area of influence.* There are a number of architectural styles along Timothy Street. The applicants have pulled certain historical features, such as windows, porches, entry doors, and roofing material that is compatible with other homes located along the street and other areas of Hampton Heights.

6.2.4 Massing

- Guideline – *The massing of a new building shall be consistent with dominant massing patterns of existing buildings in the area of influence, if such patterns are apparent.* The proposed new construction will meet the massing requirements and will be compatible with other structures in the immediate surrounding area and other areas of Hampton Heights.

6.2.5 Proportion

- Guideline – *The proportions of a new building shall be consistent with dominant patterns of proportions of existing buildings in the area of influence if such patterns are apparent.* The existing structures along Timothy Street consist of different styles; however the proportions are all compatible. The proposed new construction will meet the requirements of this guideline.

6.2.6 Rhythm

- Guideline – *New construction in historic district areas shall respect and not disrupt existing rhythmic patterns in the area of influence, if such patterns are apparent.* The proposed new construction will match the existing structures with regards to meeting all setback requirements, façade and porch design, and other requirements as stated under this guideline.

6.2.7 Scale/Height

- Guideline – *New construction in historic areas shall be consistent with dominant patterns of scale within the area of influence, if such patterns are present.*
- Guideline – *A proposed new building shall appear to conform to the floor-to-floor heights of existing structures if there is a dominant pattern within the established area of influence.*
 - The proposed new construction will be just under 900 sq. ft. and the height, being one story, will be consistent to the majority of the homes along Timothy Street.

6.2.8 Architectural and Site Elements

- Guideline – *New construction shall reference and not conflict with the predominant site and architectural elements of existing properties in the area of influence.* The proposed new construction will meet the requirements of using materials and designs that are compatible with the historic structures.

6.3.2 New Construction

- Guideline – *New construction shall reference predominant design characteristics that make an area distinctive in order to achieve creative and compatible design solutions that are more than just mere imitations of existing buildings.* The proposed new construction will be just that, a new construction. However, it will provide design characteristics, materials, and details that are compatible with the existing structures in the immediate surrounding area and other areas of Hampton Heights.

The US Secretary of the Interior’s Guidelines for Rehabilitation – Standards for Rehabilitation

- *New Additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.*
- *New additions, and adjacent or related new construction, shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.*

Staff Analysis and Recommendation

Compared to the guidelines stated in the Spartanburg Design Manual and the US Secretary of the Interior’s Guidelines for Rehabilitation, Staff believes the design and location of the proposed new infill house is appropriate and consistent with Timothy Street. The proposed house meets all setbacks and lot area requirements as stated in the City of Spartanburg Zoning Ordinance for new single family residential construction. The house will express today’s modern characteristics and also will be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features of the existing houses in this district. Staff believes that this new construction will be compatible with the district, and therefore, Staff recommends the Board approve the applicant’s request for a Certificate of Appropriateness, permitting the infill construction of a new house within the Hampton Heights Historic District.

[Editor’s Note: The applicant was present but did not have anything else to add to Mr. Henderson’s presentation].

Mr. Belenchia opened the public hearing and asked anyone who wished to speak in favor of the request to come forward.

- Randy Cooksey of 539 South Irwin Avenue came forward and said he had just found out about this request earlier today.

Mr. Belenchia asked anyone in opposition of the request to come forward. No one came forward. Mr. Belenchia closed the public hearing.

Board Questions and Comments

- Mr. Koenig asked why the applicant did not want to use the porch that was on the slide of the proposed new house. Mr. Henderson said the porch shown on the slide was not compatible with what was in the neighborhood, and the applicant wanted to go with a porch that was more compatible.

[Editor’s Note: Board Member Carolyn Schoepf- Harrison arrived to the meeting at 5:48 P.M.]

- Mr. Meek, the City’s Preservation Architect came forward and was sworn. He said they had gone through the McAlester Book looking at different prototypes and there were a few porches that were more appropriate for this type of house, as well as the neighborhood, and the applicant had chosen to go with one of those, and not have a wrap-a-round porch. He also said that Timothy Street had been developed a little

later in Hampton Heights, and most of the houses were very simplified, and was more of a lower middle class home. Because of this the applicant felt they should down style the porch.

- Mr. Koenig asked about the house being re-addressed on Timothy Street. Mr. Henderson referenced a slide of the property; and he pointed out the layout of the property including the railroad tracks at the rear of the property. He said placement was up to the buyer of the property, as long as she met the requirements of the Zoning Ordinance.
- Mr. Koenig asked about a driveway. Ms. White said it would probably come up near the front of the property, and that there would not be a garage.

Mr. Koenig made a motion to approve the request as presented; and he was seconded by Mrs. Love. The motion was unanimously approved by a vote of 5 to 0.

Certificate of Appropriateness for Major Work – Consider the construction of an approximately 500 sq. ft. addition to the rear of the structure with an additional deck on the structure located at 526 Hampton Drive, in the Hampton Heights Local Historic District (TMS#7-16-02-155.00). Aaron Ryba, Agent, on behalf of Lukas Hauser & Julie Sexeny, Owners.

Mr. Henderson came forward and was sworn, and submitted the report the Board Members had previously received, as well as the slides and presentation into evidence as Exhibit A. He said Aaron Ryba was present to present the applicant's case, as well as the applicants.

Mr. Aaron Ryba of 10 Moore Avenue, Asheville, N.C. came forward and was sworn. He informed the Board Members the applicants would like to construct an approximately 500 sq. ft. addition on the rear of the structure to include a sunroom and a master suite with an additional rear deck. Mr. Ryba showed a slide of the home; and explained the applicants had owned the home for eight or nine years now; and needed a little more room. He informed the Board Members the applicant's had worked with staff since they had owned the home, in order to make some other improvements to the home, and this was the next step. The following slides were shown in order to better illustrate the request: floor plans, elevation drawing, before and after drawings.

Mr. Henderson came forward again, and said the proposed structure and deck would meet the thirty (30') foot required rear setback measured from the rear property line, and would not encroach any closer to side yard setback of eight (8') feet. The proposed addition would match the existing with regards to roof pitch and building materials. He explained the proposed addition met the criteria for reviewing a Certificate of Appropriateness request. Mr. Henderson went over and explained the five criteria when considering an addition to the property which the Board Members had previously received in the meeting packets. He concluded his presentation by saying Staff's Analysis of the required findings for this case was the Owner had worked diligently to ensure that the proposed addition met all the criteria of the Guidelines, and would construct an addition that was both compatible with the existing structure and apparent that it fits with the time of construction. Staff recommends approval of the request.

Mr. Belenchia opened the public hearing and asked anyone who wished to speak in favor of the request to come forward.

- Mr. Randy Cooksey of 539 S. Irwin Avenue came forward and said he was in favor of the request.

Mr. Belenchia asked anyone else who wished to speak in favor or against the request to come forward. No one else came forward. Mr. Belenchia closed the public hearing.

Board Deliberation:

After some discussion, Mr. Settle moved to approve the request as presented; and he was seconded by Mr. Koenig. The motion was unanimously approved by a vote of 5 to 0.

Update on Approved Certificate of Appropriateness for Minor Works since the February 12, 2015 – Joshua Henderson.

Mr. Henderson went over the minor work cases approved by Staff since the February 12, 2015 meeting.

Other Business – none.

STAFF ANNOUNCEMENTS:

Mr. Henderson informed the Board Members tonight would be his last meeting for the City of Spartanburg, and tomorrow on Friday, June 12, 2015 would be his last day. He had taken a position with Spartanburg County. He said he would miss working with Staff as well as all the Board Members.

Mr. Henderson thanked Board Members Thomas Belenchia and Lewis Settle whose terms would be expired on the Board as of June 30, 2015. He thanked them for all their service on the Board.

Mrs. Roland informed the Board Members that as of June 30, 2015 there would be four vacant positions on the Board, and if anyone knew of someone that would be interested in serving on the Board to please let her know and she would send them a form to be filled out and sent back to be sent to the City Clerk for consideration by the Mayor and City Council.

There being no other business, the meeting adjourned at 5:37 P.M.



Dr. Phillip Stone, Chair

Minutes by Julie Roland, Administrative Assistant