

MINUTES

The Spartanburg Board of Architectural Design and Historic Review Thursday, February 12, 2015 ~ 5:30 PM City Hall Council Chambers

Board Members Attendance: Dr. Phillip Stone, II., Michael Chewning, Lewis Settle, Sarah Love, and Thomas Belenchia.

Absent Board Members: Carolyn Schoepf Harrison, Matthew Manley, and Thomas Koenig.

City Staff: Joshua Henderson, Planning Coordinator; Julie Roland, Administrative Assistant, and Martin Meek, Preservation Specialist. Assistant City Manager Chris Story also attended the meeting.

Dr. Stone, the Chair called the meeting to order at 5:35 P.M. and stated the hearing procedures. Dr. Stone recognized the five board members that were present constituted a quorum, and he proceeded with the guidelines for the procedure of the meeting.

Mrs. Love made a motion to approve the Agenda for tonight's meeting, and was seconded by Mr. Settle. The motion was approved by a vote of 5 to 0.

Disposition of the minutes from the January 8, 2015 Meeting of the Board of Architectural Design and Historic Review.

Mr. Chewning moved to approve the minutes from the January 8, 2015 meeting; and he was seconded by Mrs. Love. The motion was unanimously approved by a vote of 5 to 0.

Old Business

There was no old business for discussion.

New Business

Public Hearing regarding Petition to have Bon Haven located at 728 N. Church Street (c. 1884) added to the City of Spartanburg Historic Site Pending List – Assistant City Manager Chris Story and Joshua Henderson.

Dr. Stone explained they were here this evening to consider a petition submitted by ten City residents to place Bon Haven property on the City's Historic Register. He said the way the process worked, was ten citizens could propose listing a property and the Board of Architectural Design & Historic Review could put the property on the pending list, do a formal investigation, conduct a public hearing and decide whether or not to nominate the property to City Council for inclusion on the City's Historic Site List. He explained they were here to conduct the public hearing. Dr. Stone said the Board Members would need to establish the rules for the public hearing before the public comment portion.

Mr. Henderson came forward and was sworn, and submitted the report the Board Members had previously received, as well as the slides and presentation into evidence as Exhibit A. He said the property was located at the corner of the Asheville Highway and Chapel Street; and he referenced a slide of the location map and aerial photograph.

Dr. Stone asked the petitioner if they received the proposed Public Hearing Rules that set sixty minutes as the time to conduct the public hearing with a limit of three minutes per speaker. The petitioner said yes.

Mrs. Love moved to approve the rules for the public hearing, and was seconded by Mr. Settle. The motion was unanimously approved by a vote of 5 to 0.

Mr. Henderson reminded everyone present if they came up to speak, to please sign the Sign-In sheet for the record.

Dr. Stone offered the opportunity for the property owner to make a statement regarding the request.

Mr. Larry Flynn, Attorney recently retained to represent the property owners with Pope Ziegler Law Firm in Spartanburg, came forward and was sworn. He felt it was important for everyone to know the property was owned by Cleve Land 3 Limited Partnership and LEROMA Family Partnership who were the heirs of Mr. Cleveland; and they had descendants that lived in California, Alabama, Texas, and Dexter Cleveland lived in Spartanburg, S.C. who was present tonight. Also present tonight was Mr. Cleveland's Sister, Donna, along with his Niece, Jessica Derrick who was not an owner, but had an active interest in the property, who lived in Charleston, S.C. Mr. Flynn informed the Board Members they were here tonight to ask the Board Members to

vote to remove the property from consideration on the Pending List, and remove the historical requirements regarding the list of historical properties. He explained the property had been under contract with Southern Accents Architectural Antiques located in Coleman, Alabama since November 17, 2014 for the deconstruction of the property. He said as it was explained at the January 8, 2015 meeting, the house had been vacant since 1995, it was no longer suitable for residential use, the house was never fully modernized, and extensive tree damage occurred about a year ago that caused the roof to leak which resulted in even more damage to the property. The owners had searched for new uses for Bon Haven in order to make preservation in place possible, but to no avail. They had conversations with representatives of VCOM, Converse and Wofford Colleges, and Spartanburg Regional. It was not part of the Northside Initiative project. The Cleveland's had been very civic minded, and had done a number of worthwhile preservation projects that many of them were familiar with such as the Georgia Cleveland Home that was now the St. Luke's Free Medical Clinic; had made significant pledges to the Spartanburg County Library and created the Cleveland Genealogical Room, donated the 1947 railroad caboose to the City of Spartanburg, they had been involved in the Wofford College Advisory fund, restored five historic buildings in downtown Spartanburg, had sold property to the Spartanburg Regional for their Hospice House, and he said the list went on and on. Mr. Flynn said again the property had been vacant since 1995; and he felt the Cleveland's had done a masterful job in maintaining the property since that time, which included the property taxes which had been maintained at a cost of in excess of \$17,000.00 per year. He showed a picture of the tree that had fallen on the house that was a big reason why they were here today. Mr. Flynn informed the Board Members that Bon Haven was not secured; they had fenced the property and done everything they could to try and secure the property but they had had a lot of problems with vandalism, theft, rot and decay, which the designation of this property as a historic site would not fix any of those problems. It was the opinion of the Cleveland family (owners) that the deconstruction that was being proposed was the last best way to save Bon Haven. Mr. Flynn informed the Board Members he had with him tonight Dr. Doyle Boggs, Al Jolly, Martin Meek, and Jessica Derrick to speak regarding the property. Mr. Flynn said since the last hearing of the Board Members; City Code went out and presented to the owners an enforcement that had now been abated and presented it into evidence as Exhibit B, and a copy of series to the editors where he had highlighted the articles relevant to that particular point, as Exhibit C.

Dr. Doyle Boggs, an alumnus and previous Chair of the HARB Board came forward and was sworn. He said the HARB had been excellent for Spartanburg, and had helped put the City into context, which was a major problem in Spartanburg, as well as gave the City a chance to be a Certified Local Government (CLG) which was extremely important. It had enabled the City to consult with two of the best preservation architects in the State at little or no cost. He commended all the Board Members and previous Board Members for their service. He said he would like to share with the Board Members an experience he had with Dr. Don Fowler, a Professor of Political Science at the University of S.C., as well as a major political figure. Dr. Fowler once told him that the three most dangerous words that could come out of a committee were "why don't we"... in this case, "why don't we" save Bon Haven. He said there were a couple of issues that occurred anytime those words were said. He said the first issue was the fact that Bon Haven was a residence, and to make it anything else would be extremely costly. They needed to look and see if that money would be well spent, and if the delay would be well used. The other issue was the context. Was there anyway to have anything that remotely resembled the original context of this home to what it was. He felt the slides that were shown should cast grave doubt that this could be done in a cost effective way. He felt saving Bon Haven was a noble cause; and if they could put all the pieces together and make it work it would be very worthwhile, but he was not sure it could be done.

Mr. Flynn asked about his comment earlier comment regarding casual demolition. Dr. Boggs explained one of the main reasons to have a HARB Board was to prevent casual demolition; in this particular case casual demolition was probably beyond what had happened. He further explained he did not consider this case casual demolition.

Mr. Al Jolly, a Spartanburg Architect came forward and was sworn. He referenced a slide of where the tree had fallen on the house approximately fourteen months prior; and said that was really when the whole thing started. The Cleveland's had a contractor look at all the damage and were told just to stabilize the structure would have been approximately \$90,000.00. He showed more slides regarding the destruction inside the structure. Mr. Jolly asked if they were to save Bon Haven what would its use be. If it was used for anything other than a single

family use, it would trigger bringing the entire structure up to code, and he explained that would be a massive undertaking, and the cost would differ depending on the different scenarios regarding the exact usage. Mr. Jolly mentioned a home in the Converse Heights area he was involved in restoring, which was a lot smaller than Bon Haven that was \$250.00 a square foot. He felt it would be in excess of four to five million dollars easy to restore Bon Haven.

Mr. Flynn asked Mr. Jolly if he had an opinion regarding if nothing was done to the house as to what would happen to the structure as it currently existed. Mr. Jolly felt that within perhaps a year there would be complete devastation to that entire corner of the house.

Mr. Flynn asked Mr. Jolly if he had been in the house recently. Mr. Jolly said he had been in the house twice in the last year.

Mr. Flynn asked Mr. Jolly had he noticed deterioration that had accelerated during that period of time. Mr. Jolly explained he had noticed quite a bit of deterioration from his first visit to his second visit to the structure this year.

Board Member Thomas Belenchia asked Mr. Jolly regarding the damage on the inside of the house, could he tell him whether that was from the tree falling on the house, or non-use of the house, or from the demolition crews. Mr. Jolly said he did not know.

Board Member Belenchia asked Mr. Jolly about his earlier statement he thought he had made regarding the tree that fell on the house precipitated the damage to the whole house. Mr. Jolly said it had certainly caused some of it because the house was open. A tarpaulin had recently been put over the hole in the last few weeks.

Board Member Belenchia asked Mr. Jolly did he not think it would have been wise in his opinion, to put a tarpaulin over the damage after it had occurred to prevent further damage to the home. Mr. Jolly said it probably would have been.

Mr. Flynn asked Mr. Jolly would putting up a tarp have solved the problem or would it have required more to secure the property. Mr. Jolly said it would have been a temporary band aid.

Mr. Belenchia asked Mr. Jolly if the tarp had been put up immediately after the limbs had been removed, if someone had been interested in preventing further damage to the home, would that have slowed down the deterioration. Mr. Jolly said it would have slowed down deterioration portion under the hole in the roof.

Mr. Flynn called Jessica Derrick.

Ms. Derrick came forward and was sworn, and explained her Great-Great Grandfather built Bon Haven, and she was here on behalf of the family. She had no ownership in the house, but loved the house; and she had spent the last fifteen years working with architects, interior designers, preservationists, and conservationists and had access to people who worked in this field, in order to look for solutions for the home. They all love Bon Haven; and explained it was not that they did not want to save it. She explained about the very expensive wall paper in the home that was her favorite part of the house. She explained there had been a lot of work done each time the home was shown to someone that would want to preserve it; but she further explained it was more than someone just buying the property and fixing a hole in the roof. You needed to have the means and motivation to take care of a home such as this, along with the financial obligations. The upstairs roofs had been falling in for years. She notified Mr. Cleveland when she first visited the home after the tree had fell, which they determined had been about three weeks after a severe storm. She met in Charleston, S.C. with the Vice President and Regional Director of National Trust for Historic Homes who informed her that when families had exhausted all viable options, that deconstruction done responsibly was a viable option as opposed to a wrecking ball. She explained they had been looking for a solution for a long time. She was informed of some companies that were preservation minded, one being Southern Accents, to deconstruct the home. She said what's next for Bon Haven mattered very much to the family; and it was a very complicated decision. Also no other buyer had presented themselves; and she felt to delay what was happening with the house now exposed it to more deterioration. She explained how they had kept the house fully furnished for years because they felt it would look better to a potential buyer. In the meantime they had a lot of valuable items stolen from the house. After increased vandalism and the tree falling on the house, resulted in the family having most of the belongings gotten out of the house, and had the house boarded up.

Mr. Flynn asked Ms. Derrick about her credentials. Ms. Derrick said she was in the publishing business and had been in New York and S.C., and had contacts with all types of appropriate people such as master craftsmen, trade specialists, founding members of preservation organizations, etc. regarding Bon Haven.

Mr. Flynn asked Ms. Derrick about the wall paper she had explained earlier; and he asked her if the wall paper that was so expensive had just fallen off. She said it had molded off.

Ms. Derrick said there had been opportunities for different groups to save Bon Haven, and not much had been done. From knowing where they were to where they are now with the house, not very much had been done by these groups to raise awareness until the family was in a very vulnerable place.

Mr. Flynn asked in her opinion based on conversations she had with some of the above referenced people and groups, did she feel the family had any other choice other than the contract with Southern Accents. Ms. Derrick said they could have done nothing which would have been irresponsible, they could have sold it, and that hasn't happened; and based on those conversations they were the right organizations.

Mr. Flynn asked if she would receive any kind of compensation from the sale of Bon Haven. She said no.

Board Questions:

- Dr. Phillip Stone asked Ms. Derrick when she first observed the fallen tree. Ms. Derrick said on August 13th. She mentioned when in the attic there were weak parts of the roof, and there was one side of the home that had had some water damage, and the paint had been chipping off some; and they would pick it up and repaint in order to show the home. With only one family member in town, the rate at which it was deteriorating took on a life of its own, and was too much.
- Mr. Belenchia asked Ms. Derrick who "we" were. She said her uncle Dexter was the family member that lived in town; her mother was Dexter's sister who had a fifty percent ownership in the house, and the other cousins had a fifty percent ownership. But primarily when she said "we" she was talking about herself and Dexter Cleveland regarding being in the house and trying to take care of those matters.
- Mr. Belenchia asked Ms. Derrick if it ever occurred to her or anyone else in the family after the hole had been discovered in the roof, it needed to be covered. Ms. Derrick said yes, but it was not just a hole in the roof, it was the whole back structure, the kitchen, windows; and then you had to discuss everything with all of the other members out of state and out of the country. Ms. Derrick said she knew he was correct in saying that a tarp probably should have been put over the hole; but in her opinion, to talk about restoring the damage from the storm, the conversation the family really needed to have was regarding putting a fence around the house, or board up everything and the process had took longer than it should have and she didn't think anyone thought it was going to take as long as it did, and no one had anticipated the amount of damage that was going to occur in the meantime.
- Mr. Belenchia informed Mr. Flynn that he was curious about all of the editorials to the newspaper in support to let the Cleveland Family deconstruct the home and the HARB Board should get out of the way. He said from Mr. Walsh's presentation at the last meeting; he was under the impression that some good soul out of Mississippi was going to purchase and save the house, and it would be restored and protected in Mississippi; and then he came to find out that he doesn't know now if the contract really existed.
- Mr. Flynn said that a contract exists to provide for the deconstruction and removal of the building materials in such a fashion that it would be possible to be able to reconstruct (depending on how you wanted to define that term); would it mean picking Bon Haven up and relocating it in Mississippi; no. Mr. Flynn said it was his opinion that the re-constructed home would be more of a replica of Bon Haven.
- Mr. Belenchia said he felt a little misled by the January 8, 2015 meeting from Mr. Walsh's presentation, because it was his understanding it would be dismantled and reconstructed; and regarding to each of the letters to the editors, they kept referring to why would anyone object to an entity that had agreed to save and repurpose and restore the house in Mississippi. Mr. Belenchia said Mr. Flynn had provided these letters to the editor as evidence tonight; and he explained he just felt misled.
- Ms. Derrick came forward again and said the family's previous attorney, Bill Walsh retired in October, 2014; and the family felt like they needed to respect his retirement; and had then retained Mr. Flynn. She

explained the family did have a contract originally with Southern Accent; and that Garland, whose business was Southern Accents had visited Bon Haven; and he was willing to take on the challenge that was to oversee the deconstruction of Bon Haven. Garland had shared the project with a builder named Jay, that wished to partner with his company in order to rebuild it in Oxford, Mississippi and (this was not a Cleveland decision). People had gotten different parts of the story. She said when Garland shared that information with her over a phone conversation, she had mixed emotions, but was glad at the time that Bon Haven would live on somewhere.

- Mr. Belenchia wondered how all the people that had written in to the editor had found out about the move and seemed to know more than the HARB Board Members. Ms. Derrick said she did not know.
- Mr. Belenchia said he was hoping Mr. Walsh would be at tonight's meeting, because he as a Board Member felt misled, and now he finds out there is no contract; and that was what he was trying to figure out.
- Ms. Derrick said they were not privy to the contract that Southern Accents had with Jay. In the midst of that Jay's interest in historic preservation and Garland's business wanted to be on the right side of the debate. She said if any of that had now changed, she did not know about it.
- Mr. Belenchia asked Ms. Derrick as far as she still knew, there might still be a contract with someone to deconstruct and move the house to Mississippi. Ms. Derrick said that was correct.
- Mr. Flynn echoed what Ms. Derrick said and felt what the issue came down to for the Board Members to look at was that this would be the last best alternative for the home. He said either it would sit there and wait to collapse or it could be deconstructed and moved and be preserved.
- Mr. Donnie Love, former Chair of the HARB Board came forward and was sworn. He was also on the Board of Directors for the Palmetto Trust for Historic Preservation, as well as an architect. He felt it was this Board's duty to determine whether this structure met the criteria for designation for being placed on the Historic Pending List (which he explained it did); and said they should recommend it as such to the Mayor and City Council. He explained the architectural significance of the structure was unequaled in this area.
- Kristi Webb, resident of Spartanburg and Hampton Heights, as well as Co-Chair for the Save Bon Haven Foundation, and Michael Bedenbaugh, resident of Prosperity, SC and Executive Director of Palmetto Trust for Historic Preservation came forward and were sworn. Mrs. Webb introduced their presentation into evidence as Exhibit D. Slides were shown and Mrs. Webb explained why John B. Cleveland and the structure was so important to Spartanburg, S.C. She said they would also like to profile the component of the Bon Haven Trust. Also numerous contributions by the Mr. Cleveland .
- Mr. Flynn objected and said the Bon Haven Trust had nothing to do with this meeting.
- Mr. Belenchia and Mr. Settle did not think it was proper to interrupt someone making a presentation.
- Dr. Stone, the Chair agreed, and said the Board Members were going to take into consideration all the evidence in order for the body to make a decision.
- Mr. Bedenbaugh explained they were trying to show evidence of the original builder's and his son's intentions regarding the purpose and importance of this place, and how they tried to project that into the family and into the heirs, as well as the fact that there was financial means that were set aside to maintain this property until the court order of the trust expired which was cashed out in 2001. Mr. John B. Cleveland meant to see that this place would survive.
- Mr. Belenchia said he thought if anyone had questions they could be addressed later on.
- Mrs. Webb said without Bon Haven that Mr. Cleveland's story, as well as Spartanburg's story was incomplete. She said regarding the salvage contract, instead of being a reconstruction, it appeared to be a salvage and scatter by Southern Accents; and she said they had seen evidence of where they were listing pieces of the home's antiques were already being sold over the internet.
- Mr. Bedenbaugh said every since this had gotten started, he had tried to communicate with Mr. Dexter Cleveland regarding what they could bring to the table; and he was told that was not going to happen. He

found out who the salvage company was and went to them and met with Garland. What had already happened was that two tractor trailer loads had already been removed from the home.

- Mr. Flynn objected.
- Dr. Stone said this was their presentation to be made at this point.
- Mr. Bedenbaugh continued and said he met with Garland, the Salvage owner, who agreed to sell them back all the salvage that came out of the house for \$200,000.00 to keep it from leaving because he was concerned about the fact if it could be saved, he did not want to see that happen. Because of the financial investment their company had already made they had to get some type of return out of it. Mr. Bedenbaugh said he fully understood the concern the family had; and he expected the family had thought the home was going to be reconstructed; and he added unfortunately that was not going to happen. He said he believed initially that a contract originally existed regarding the reconstruction in Oxford, Mississippi. He said part of his agreement with Garland was to sign a non-disclosure regarding the contract, and he had seen the contract. He said it was now a salvage contract and it would not be going to Mississippi to be reconstructed; and that Garland had released him to say that.
- Mrs. Webb said they were currently in a campaign phase to raise money since Mr. Bedenbaugh had met with the salvage company; and they had been very willing to work with them until February 22, 2015 in order to give them the opportunity to raise \$200,000.00 at which time they would either bring a tractor trailer load of what had already been removed from the house back; or they would be coming back to pick up what was left in the house and take it to Alabama. The salvage company had put a hold on all of the belongings that were on-line for sale from what had already been removed.
- Mrs. Webb said they had a very busy two weeks; and had been volunteering to raise public awareness, had contacted a lot of face book fans to raise money, and they had received a lot of regional and national attention. They believed there was an opportunity for Bon Haven to be sold at a fair market price and they would like to honor Mr. John B. Cleveland and his wish for the legacy to be preserved.
- Mr. Bedenbaugh said as a statewide preservation organization; it was their organizations obligation that all efforts were made to save irreplaceable historic structures; and Bon Haven qualified for that. It was also their obligation to insure that destruction that took place around the fate of those buildings be communicated truthfully to the community and its leaders as decisions of those properties futures were discussed. They know that development was the key to preservation. They do not believe the house can be restored as keeping it under a shell such as a museum where people could come and visit. He disagreed with any statement that this house could be restored as anything but a house; and said that was not true. They know the highest and best use for the property, community, and the family was to include the uniqueness of the house as a center piece of any commercial venture, whether it was a hotel, or etc. However, he explained the asset of the property to be the complete property.
- Mr. Bedenbaugh explained he first met Dexter Cleveland on October, 2012; and they toured the house and grounds on that day, as well as several other times to discuss Bon Haven's future. They could never get to the point where they could go all in and get the house for the same reason no sale had taken place in all these years. One reason was because it was heir's property, and they could never get in front of all the heirs at one time, which made it impossible for them to pitch a case of any sort. The other reason was because the asking price as opposed to the condition of the property was unrealistic. He noted a lot has been put as to what had happened to the one story kitchen wing regarding destruction. He further noted that even if that wing was totally gone, it would not compromise its standing on the National Register. He said that was why Wofford College, Converse College, and Spartanburg Regional Hospital had declined to purchase the home regarding the price.
- Mr. Bedenbaugh said they understood the financial burden of the property to the family; and as a state-wide preservation entity they knew the property could be saved and could put dollars in the family's pockets. They would like to offer help to purchase the property if a price that represented the true value of the property was established and set, in order for them to take it to the market place, and allow Palmetto Trust full access to market the property and allow them a minimum of at least one year to attract a buyer, and that the \$250,000 fundraise they had already endeavored on would cover the cost of purchasing the product

back, cover the property taxes for next year, and cover the fee the salvagers were going to pay the family for the rights.

- Mrs. Webb concluded her part of the presentation by showing a slide of the Dupree House; and she explained if you waited long enough for something that it would and could happen. Mrs. Webb also clarified what they had entered into evidence as well.

Board Questions:

- Mr. Belenchia asked Mr. Bedenbaugh if he had been given any information about the supposed contract regarding the Mississippi partner.
- Mr. Bedenbaugh said he was made aware there was an entity that had expressed interest, but he was also led to believe it did not exist anymore.
- Mr. Belenchia asked if he was led to believe that the proposed contract terminated prior to January.
- Mr. Bedenbaugh said he was never led to believe there was a formal contract; but that did not mean it did not exist.
- Mrs. Webb said they do know they were selling things from the house as early as December, 2014 and January, 2015.

Mr. Love came forward again and said he felt the Board Members should look at the Guidelines; and he felt their real duty was to determine whether the structure was historic or not; and they would like for them to do that tonight, and also recommend to City Council that it be placed on the Pending List.

Dr. Stone opened the public hearing portion and said they would allow sixty minutes for the public comment portion of the meeting and each person would have a time limit of three minutes in which to speak; and he asked anyone who wished speak regarding the request to come forward and introduce themselves and then sign the sign-in sheet after they spoke that would be noted for the record.

- Ms. Emily Powell of 736 Lucerne Drive came forward and was in support of saving Bon Haven, and named all of Mr. John B. Cleveland's attributes to Spartanburg.
- Mr. Brad Steinecke of 482 Pinckney Court came forward and thanked the Board Members for their work; and said he was in support of the request to save the home. He thought the loss of Bon Haven would affect more than just the Cleveland family.
- Dr. Steve Cherry of 870 Inverness Circle came forward and was in support of the request. He mentioned his daughter who was currently working in Charleston, SC had tried to submit an opinion letter to the editor for the newspaper, who deterred her from submitting anything that might receive significant backlash from the community.
- Ms. Meliah McCraw of 384 Green River Road came forward and spoke in favor of the request.
- Ms. Caroline Wilson of 203 N. Miller Street, Greer, S.C. came forward and said she grew up in Spartanburg; and was in support of the request. She felt Spartanburg should be good stewards of properties such as the proposed property.
- Ms. Lesly Turner of 119 Fernridge Drive came forward in support of the request, and felt it was a huge piece of history that Spartanburg needed to save.
- Ms. Shelley Carter of 160 Meadowview Drive came forward and was in support of the request and explained how she viewed this home as Spartanburg's version of Downton Abbey.
- Mr. Constantine Ramantanin of 1005 River Road came forward and hoped someone could help Spartanburg save Bon Haven.
- Ms. Bridget Webb of 254 Connecticut Avenue came forward and said she had just moved to Spartanburg this past summer; and said she was part of the face book page, Save Bon Haven.

Dr. Stone asked anyone else who wished to speak to come forward. No one else came forward. Dr. Stone closed the public hearing.

[Editor's Note: At 7:25 P.M. the Chair, Dr. Stone suggested everyone take a five minute recess.]

Dr. Stone called the meeting back to order at 7:43 P.M.; and asked the Assistant City Manager Chris Story to come forward and explain the process from this point forward.

Assistant City Manager Chris Story came forward and reminded the Board Members by their vote at their meeting in January the property was placed on the Pending List. Absent of any other intervention the property could stay on the list for up to a twelve month period; but in exercising a right available to the property owner, the property owner had requested an expedited consideration of process which limited the consideration to a sixty day window. The Board options include the following: 1) No action; and the property would remain on the Pending List until sixty days had expired, which would be March 11th or 12, 2015. The sixty day period was available if the parties present sought more time to seek any resolution, one route to additional time would be for the property owner to pull that back which was an additional option to the property owner; 2) a vote to nominate the property to City Council; which if that vote was taken it would appear at City Council at its next scheduled meeting which would be February 23, 2015 for their consideration; 3) City Council may opt at that time to seek additional public input if they so chose; and 4) if the Board voted not to nominate it, it would be removed from the list and there would not be any restrictions on the property.

Board Questions and/or Deliberation:

- Mr. Belenchia explained from a practical standpoint regarding all the neglect and deterioration of the home it should not be placed on the Pending List.
- Mrs. Love felt the Board Member's job was to determine whether or not the home met the guidelines; and let City Council make the ultimate decision.
- Mr. Chewning and Mr. Settle agreed with Mrs. Love.
- Mr. Belenchia explained he did not think the Board was tied exclusively to the Guidelines.
- Dr. Stone explained he felt somewhat torn in the situation as well. He agreed they were not a rubber stamp for the Guidelines; but felt their greatest obligation was to apply the Guidelines, and their second obligation was to try at least to present an option to City Council if that was what the Board chose to do. He also was sympathetic to the plight the Owners found themselves in.

Mr. Belenchia made a motion to vote not to nominate the property to City Council; and there was no second.

Mrs. Love made a motion to nominate the property to City Council and she was seconded by Mr. Chewning. The vote was approved by a vote of 4 to 1, with Mr. Belenchia voting against.

Update on Approved Certificate of Appropriateness for Minor Works since the January 8, 2015 meeting – Joshua Henderson.

Mr. Henderson went over the minor work cases approved by Staff since the January 8, 2015 meeting.

Other Business – none.

STAFF ANNOUNCEMENTS:

Dr. Stone said in lieu of the time; the Board Members could read their Staff Announcements.

There being no other business, the meeting adjourned at 7:55 P.M.

Thomas A. Belenchia acting Chair
~~Dr. Phillip Stone, II, Chair~~ *JSR 6-11-15*

Minutes by Julie Roland, Administrative Assistant