

MINUTES
The Spartanburg Board of Architectural Design and Historic Review
Meeting
Thursday, January 10, 2019 ~ 5:30 PM
City Hall Training Room

Board Members Attendance: Sarah Love, Ray Trail, Josh Lonon, Brad Steinecke, Melissa Walker, Meg Reid, Thomas Koenig, and Kathleen Crowley.

Absent Board Members: None.

City Staff: Natalia Rosario, Planner III; and Julie Roland, Administrative Assistant.

Mrs. Love, the Chair, called the HARB meeting to order at 5:30 P.M., and stated the hearing procedures. She recognized the eight Board Members present constituted a quorum, and she proceeded with the guidelines for the procedure of the meeting.

Ms. Walker moved approval of tonight's Agenda; and she was seconded by Ms. Reid. The motion was unanimously approved by a vote of 8 to 0.

Disposition of the Minutes from the November 8, 2018 Meeting.

Mr. Steinecke made a motion that the November 8, 2018 minutes be approved as submitted; and he was seconded by Mr. Koenig. The motion was approved by a vote of 8 to 0.

Old Business:

Certificate of Appropriateness for Major Work at 247 Hydrick Street in Hampton Heights – (Revised Request) –

For permission to install a front door where currently none exists with a wooden door of appropriate material and light pattern. Pedro and Tomasa Rojas, Owners.

Ms. Rosario, Planner III came forward and was sworn; and she entered into evidence the meeting packets the Board Members had previously received via email regarding both of tonight's cases, the slides and presentations as Exhibit A. She said the first case had been to the Board Members a few times now; and the petitioner's had presented a revised request for just the door which was made of oak and glass; and she referenced a slide of the proposed door made of oak and glass. Ms. Rosario said the transom size is 70" x 15", and the glass size of the door is 65.5" x 9.1/4"; which she said would fit and was made of the appropriate materials. She felt the petitioners had made as much of an effort as anyone ever had to make things right before the Board; and she would recommend approval. Ms. Rosario explained the petitioners were not present yet; and did not have a whole lot of time after 5:00 P.M., but would probably be in a little later to the meeting if the Board Members had any questions for them.

Board Questions:

- Mr. Koenig asked if this was the only remaining work from the original request.
- Ms. Rosario said yes; and she explained the earlier request had included to cover the porch and steps with stone; which the Board had denied; and had informed the petitioners they would need to replace with concrete; which she said they were in the process of doing that work.

Mrs. Love said since the Rojas were not present at the moment, she would go ahead and open the public hearing; and asked if there was anyone in the audience who wished to speak regarding the request to come forward. No one came forward. Mrs. Love closed the public hearing.

Board Deliberation:

Ms. Crowley moved the request be approved as presented by Staff; and she was seconded by Ms. Walker. The motion was unanimously approved by a vote of 8 to 0.

New Business:

Certificate of Appropriateness for Major Works – for permission to replace an existing EPDM rubber roof with a more historically appropriate metal version; and to replace existing k-style gutters on the same section of roof with traditional style half round gutters. Zack Dowds, Owner, 172 W. Hampton Avenue.

Ms. Rosario came forward and said she would like to thank the petitioner for turning in such a very concise and complete application; and she said it was the best she had seen since her employment at the City. The request was to obtain permission to replace an existing EPDM rubber roof with a more historically appropriate metal version (galvanized steel); and to replace existing k-style gutters on the same section of roof with traditional style half round gutters. Ms. Rosario went over the following list of criteria for the Board Members to consider when reviewing a Certificate of Appropriateness in the Hampton Heights Historic Neighborhood they had also received in their meeting packets; and she explained as follows:

1. *The character and appropriateness of the design* – According to the City of Spartanburg Design Guidelines for the Hampton Heights Historic Neighborhood:
 - a. **8.1.5 Roofs, Chimneys, and Dormers** – retain the original roof form. No addition to a house shall greatly alter the original form of a roof or render that form unrecognizable. Original or historic roof dormers shall also be retained. Skylights shall be installed to be as unobtrusive as possible. If additional upper-story space is required, consider using dormers placed out of view of the public right of way to create this space.
 - b. Historic roofing materials, such as clay tile and slate, should be repaired rather than replaced, if at all possible...therefore if replacement is necessary, new materials should match as closely as possible the scale, texture, and coloration of the historic roofing material.

The proposal to remove the rubber roof, which is in disrepair, and to replace it with a galvanized steel roof akin to what was appropriate for that time period, as well as to remove the more modern K style gutters and replace them with metal half round gutters is truer to the age of the home as well.
2. *The scale of the buildings* – N/A.
3. *The relationship of such elements to similar features of structures in the immediate surroundings*- Other properties in Hampton Heights feature similar roofs to the one proposed, although most of the homes that originally had metal roofs have had them replaced or are in need of repair.
4. *If the property is in a Historic District, the extent to which the alteration or construction would be harmonious with the Historic District* – Staff is of the opinion that the proposed alterations to the property are in conformity with the historic district and the home.

Staff's Analysis:

Staff recommends that the Board approve the request as presented.

Slides were shown and explained in order to better illustrate the request.

Board Questions:

- Ms. Walker asked was the entire roof being replaced or just the porch roof.
- Mr. Dowds, the Owner said it was just the one story section.
- Mr. Koenig asked about the occupation of that room.
- Mr. Dowds said it was a master bedroom, bath, and contained the central hallway that ran through the house.

Mrs. Love the Chair, asked Mr. Dowds to come to the podium.

Zack Dowds, came forward as Owner of the property and was sworn.

Mrs. Love thanked Mr. Dowds for putting together such a nice application package.

More Board Questions:

- Ms. Crowley asked about the roof pitch.
- Mr. Dowds said it would stay the same which was a one over twelve pitch; and that there was not any rot on the roof and he would put down a water barrier and then the metal roof on that portion only.
- Mr. Koenig asked about a historic drawing.
- Mr. Dowds explained that was from the Sanborn Fire Insurance Map he had googled from the University of S.C. website.

Mrs. Love opened the public hearing and asked if there was anyone present who wished to speak regarding this request. No one came forward. Mrs. Love closed the public hearing.

Board Deliberation:

Ms. Crowley moved to approve the request as presented by Staff; and she was seconded by Mr. Trail. The motion was unanimously approved by a vote of 8 to 0.

Review and Approval of the Proposed 2019 HARB Meeting Schedule.

The 2019 HARB Meeting Schedule was approved by acclamation.

Update on Approved Certificate of Appropriateness for Minor Works since the November 8, 2018 Meeting – Natalia Rosario.

Ms. Rosario went over the Certificate of Appropriateness for Minor Works that had been approved by Staff since the November 8, 2018 Meeting.

STAFF ANNOUNCEMENTS:

Mrs. Roland said there was still one vacant Board Member Position.

Ms. Crowley said she knew someone who might be interested that was an architect.

Mrs. Roland told Ms. Crowley she would email her a Board Member form.

There being no other business, the meeting adjourned at 6:00 P.M.



Sarah Love, Chair

Minutes by Julie Roland, Administrative Assistant.